

SISWG Meeting – Baltimore September 2008

The regular meeting of the IEEE Security in Storage Working Group (SISWG) 1619 met on September 26, 2008 in Baltimore and by teleconference.

Matt Ball was in the chair and James FitzGerald took minutes.

Attendance

Matt Ball, Representing Sun Microsystems (additional affiliations: M.V. Ball Tech, PrO Unlimited)

Roger Cummings, Symantec

James FitzGerald, SafeNet

Thomas Hardjono, Wave Systems

Eric Hibbard, Hitachi Data Systems

Larry Hofer, Emulex

Walt Hubis, LSI

Scott Kipp, Brocade

Bob Lockhart, nCipher

Fabio Maino, Cisco Systems

Michael Marcil, Vormetric

Kevin Marks, Dell

Luther Martin, Voltage Security

Gary McCracken, WinMagic

David McGrew, Cisco Systems

Gary Nichols, PMC Sierra

Landon Noll, Cisco Systems

Subhash Sankuratripati, NetApp

Chris Williams, HP

(visitor) Jack Cole, U.S. Army

Sponsors

We would like to thank our meeting sponsors:

- [SafeNet, Inc.](#) for providing catering and covering meeting room expenses
- [Sun Microsystems, Inc](#) for providing dial-in access.
- [LSI Corporation](#) for providing a projector

Introduction

Matt showed the patent slides and asked if anyone would like to bring forward relevant patents. No patents were brought forward.

At the beginning of the meeting, there were 15 companies represented. 14 is the quorum so we have made quorum.

Proposed Draft Agenda (all times in Pacific Daylight Time):

- 9:00: Introductions, thank sponsors
- 9:15: Review P1619.3 letter ballot results and hear new motions
- 10:00 Meet Jack Cole, Chair of IASC
- 10:15 Operating Procedures Discussion
- 11:00: Review P1619.2 Letter ballot results
- 11:45: Review new action items
- 11:50: Next meeting time and location
- noon: Adjourn

Subhash moves to approve the agenda. James seconds. With no objections, the motion passes.

Previous minutes were not approved and will need to be approved next meeting.

Review P1619.3 letter ballot results and hear new motions

Motion 1:

“Move that all P1619.3-compliant KM clients shall be able to communicate with all P1619.3-compliant KM servers.”

Walt Hubis moves for motion, Subhash Sankuratripati second it.

Discussion ensues.....

A vote was taken.

Matt Ball, Sun Microsystems	Yes
Walt Hubis, LSI	Yes
Scott Kipp, Brocade	Yes
Subhash Sankuratripati, NetApp	Yes
Larry Hofer, Emulex	No
James FitzGerald, SafeNet	Yes
Chris Williams, HP	Yes
Kevin Marks, DELL	Yes

Eric Hibbard, Hitachi Data Systems	No
Bob Lockhart, nCipher	Yes
Gary McCracken	Yes
Luther Martin, Voltage	Yes
Michael Marcil, Vormetric	No
Thomas Hardjono, Wave Systems	Yes
Landon Noll, Cisco	Yes
Gary Nichols, PMC Sierra	Abstain

The motion passes 12 y, 3 n, 1 a

Motion 2.

“Move that we define a mandatory set of two messaging and transport protocols for P1619.3; To be compliant, the KM server shall implement both and the KM client shall implement at least one of this mandatory set.”

Walt Moves, Subhash seconds.

Walt removes the motion after discussion about the coupling of the messaging and transport.

Edits:

“Move that we define a mandatory set of two messaging [delete:and transport] protocols for P1619.3; To be compliant, the KM server shall implement both and the KM client shall implement at least one of this mandatory set.”

Walt moves, Subhash seconds.

Matt Ball, Sun Microsystems	Yes
Walt Hubis, LSI	Yes
Scott Kipp, Brocade	Yes
Subhash Sankuratripati, NetApp	Yes
Larry Hofer, Emulex	Yes
James FitzGerald, SafeNet	Yes

Kevin Marks (DELL)	Yes
Eric Hibbard, Hitachi	Yes
Bob Lockhart, nCipher	Yes
Garry McCracken – Win Magic	Yes
Luther Martin, Voltage	Yes
Michael Marcil, Vormetric	Yes
Thomas Hardjono, Wave Systems	Yes
Landon Noll, Cisco	Yes
Gary Nichols, PMC Sierra	Abstain
Chris Williams, HP	No

14 Yes, 1 No, 1 Abstain

Motion 3.

“Move that we allow specifying non-mandatory messaging protocols that are outside of the mandatory set”
Walt Moves, Subhash Seconds.

Discussion ensues.

Point of clarification: This motion is about putting these non-mandatory protocols in the spec as an option to implement.

Matt recuses the chair to Eric Hibbard.

Matt moves to edit the motion to include a ‘not’ before ‘allow’, Eric Hibbard seconds.

This is a "non-friendly motion" because Walt disagrees and was the one who moved for the motion.

Move that we edit the motion to read:

“Move that we [not] allow specifying non-mandatory messaging protocols that are outside of the mandatory set”

The vote is on the edit, not on the edited motion.

Matt Ball, Sun Microsystems	Yes
Walt Hubis, LSI	No
Scott Kipp, Brocade	No
Subhash Sankuratripati, NetApp	No
Larry Hofer, Emulex	Abstain
James FitzGerald, SafeNet	Abstain
Kevin Marks (DELL)	No
Eric Hibbard, Hitachi	Yes
Bob Lockhart, nCipher	No
Garry McCracken – WinMagic	Yes
Luther Martin, Voltage Security	Abstain
Michael Marcil, Vormetric	No
Thomas Hardjono, Wave Systems	No
Landon Noll, Cisco	No
Gary Nichols, PMC Sierra	Abstain
Chris Williams, HP	No

9 No – 3 y – 4 abstain

The motion to edit fails.

Matt reclaims the chair from Eric Hibbard to continue the main motion

Roger Cummings joins the meeting.

On the original motion 3.

Matt Ball, Sun Microsystems	Yes
Walt Hubis, LSI	No
Scott Kipp, Brocade	No

Subhash Sankuratripati, NetApp	Abstain
Larry Hofer, Emulex	Abstain
James FitzGerald, SafeNet	No
Kevin Marks (DELL)	No
Eric Hibbard, Hitachi	No
Bob Lockhart, nCipher	No
Garry McCracken – Win Magic	No
Luther Martin, Voltage	No
Michael Marcil, Vormetric	No
Thomas Hardjono, Wave Systems	No
Landon Noll, Cisco	Abstain
Gary Nichols, PMC Sierra	Abstain
Chris Williams, HP	Abstain
Roger Cummings, Symantec	No

1 – Yes, 11 – No, 5 abstains
Motion Fails.

Meet Jack Cole, Chair of IASC

Met with Jack Cole.
Discussed standards group dynamics.

Operating Procedures Discussion

Discussed whether we have quorum to vote on changes to the operating procedures.

Quantum requested to be removed from the working group. This should put quorum at 18. We have 17 voting entities present so we do not have quorum.

Discussed the Operating Procedure Motions , as previously distributed by Eric Hibbard.

Fabio requested to remove the 1619.2 work from the agenda.

Operating Procedures:

Discussed Operating Procedures.

Eric Hibbard moves to start five simultaneous 14-day electronic ballots for each of the Operating Procedures motions previously distributed by Eric Hibbard and as amended during the meeting. Walt seconds.

No objections. The motion passes.

Matt moved to adjourn the meeting, James second. Without objection the meeting is adjourned
at noon, EDT.